|  | serious view of consistent absence of Sh. R R Goel, CEIDHBVN, <br> Hisar \& Sh. Tarun Chaudhary, CE/RGTPP, Hisar to the last few <br> meetings. The case is at a very crucial juncture and personal <br> presence of every member is necessary. It has been decided that <br> the matter may be brought to the notice of the higher authorities. <br> The issue regarding appointing GM/Admn., UHBVN, as member <br> in the committee be also perused with higher authorities. <br> The submissions made by petitioners (Narender Sharma. \& others) <br> in CWP no. 8431 of 2007 and the respondents (Sh. T. R Dhingra, <br> Sh. Rajinder Singh Redhu, Smm. Seema Sidana, Sh. Chanda <br> Singh \& others) during the personal hearing were taken on <br> record. However, the petitioner (Dharam Bir) in CWP no. 17721 <br> of 2006 sought time to make written submission by 28.08.2014. |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| The committee allowed request made by him. |  |



committee for personal hearing in the matter.
b) The petitioners (Vijender Sangwan \& Ors ) in CWP no. 11909 of 2006, (Raj kumar Sharma \& Ors) in CWP no. 12099 of 2006 submitted their representations.
c) The committee discussed the issue for personal hearing asked by the Respondents/Petitioners in the connected cases of CWP no. 16330 of 2005 , who have requested for granting them personal hearing as they could not attend the personal hearing scheduled for them, due to the one or another reason.
d) The committee discussed to compile the information of all the CWPs relating to the case wherein personal hearing has been granted as the hearings are likely to conclude in near future.
2. After deliberations, the Committee decided as under:-
a) The submissions made by the petitioners \{Vijender Sangwan \& Ors\} in CWP no. 11909 of 2006, \{Raj kumar Sharma \& Ors\} in CWP no. 12099 of 2006, during the personal hearing were taken on record.
b) The committee also decided to accord a common personal hearing to all the Respondents/Petitioners in the connected cases of CWP no. 16330 of 2005 , who have requested for granting them personal hearing as they could not attend the personal hearing scheduled for them. The schedule date \& time shall be finalized separately.
c) The Member Secretary of this Committee in co-ordination with Dy. Secretary/Gazetted, if required, will compile the information of all the CWPs relating to the case wherein personal hearing has been granted on the followings format:-

| Sr. No. | Prayer of | Stand of | Prayer of | Prayer of | Prayer of the |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

- ${ }^{2}$ the
the
in CWP

|  | Stand of <br> Utility in <br> the reply to <br> CWP | Prayer of <br> the <br> respondent <br> in lieu of <br> CWP |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  |


| $f$ | Prayer of <br> the | Prayer of the <br> Respondent <br> fer Personal |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Petitioner | in Personal |
| in | Hearing |  |
|  |  |  |

1. During the proceedings of the meeting:-
a) The petitioner (Atul Kumar Jain) in CWP no. 9175 of 2006, and the respondents (i.e. Sh. T. R Dhingra \& Ors) appeared before the committee for personal hearing in the matter.
b) The petitioner (Atul Kumar Jain) in CWP no. 9175 of 2006, submitted a representation.
c) The committee discussed the issue for personal hearing asked by the Respondents/Petitioners in the connected cases of CWP no. 16330 of 2005 , who could not attend the personal hearing scheduled for them, due to the one or another reason.
d) The committee discussed the issue of framing of common ranking list as the hearings are likely to conclude in near future. The issue regarding re-assigning of seniority to the Assistant Engineers on the basis of availability of quota post from the date they could reckon their service will be started after framing of common ranking list as per deliberation in the minutes of meeting held on 04.04.2014.
2. After deliberations, the Committee decided as under:-
a) The submission made by the petitioner (Atul Kumar Jain) in CWP no. 9175 of 2006, during the personal hearing were taken on record.
b) The Committee decided to accord personal hearing on 29.09.2014 at 1100 AM to all the Respondents/Petitioners in the connected cases of CWP no. 16330 of 2005, who have asked for granting them personal hearing but could not attend the personal hearing scheduled for them. The personal hearing to other Petitioners i.e CWP no. 10195/1993, 10168/2006, 798/2007 and CWP no. 12395/1997 which have been decided by the Hon'ble Court by making a reference to orders in CWP no. 16330 of 2005 and as per Memo No Ch-16/HPG/GE/GenI218/PH/C dated 01.09.2014.
c) The committee decided that in order to have a view on the subject the following members of the sub-committees constituted for this


b. The Committee considered the request of Petitioners to allow their counsel to attend personal hearing and decided not to allow the counsel for the petitioners (Parveen Arora \& Ors. ) in CWP no. 16330 of 2005 as the personal hearing is scheduled for Petitioners/Respondents only.
c. The Committee considered that for compiling the data in respect of the representations/submission given by petitioners/respondents etc. As per directions given in the MOM dated 05.09.2014 [Point No. 3;(3)] the Member Secretary shall require continuous association of some conversant persons. Accordingly Committee decided that Sh. Sandeep Bhatnagar, Advocate shall be associated with Member Secretary to compile the said data. For further support CE/Admn., HPGCL shall arrange to provide the man power to complete the work without delay.
d. The committee decided that in order to have a view on the subject the following members of the sub-committees constituted for this subject are deputed on full time basis to work in collective manner for framing common Seniority list of Engineering Subordinates under 22.5\% Diploma Holder Quota in compliance to orders in CWP No. 10195 of 1993, CWP No. 12395 of 1997, CWP No. 11909 of 2006, CWP No. 12099 of 2006, CWP No. 17721 of 2006:-

| Sr. | Name | Designation |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Sh. Prem Lal Sh. Yogender V | Supdt.-cum-Member, Sub-Committee, HPGCL UDC-cum-Member Sub-Committee HPGCL |
| 2 | Sh. Ram Chander <br> Sh. Shashi kant | Supdt.-cum-Member, Sub-Committee, UHBVNL <br> Asstt.-cum-Member, UHBVNL |
| 3 | Sh. Jarnail Singh Sh. Sanjeev | Asstt-cum-Member, Sub-Committee, HVPNL Asstt-cum-Member, Sub-Committee, HVPNL |
| 4 | Sh. Ram Tilak | Dy. Supdt.-cum-Member, DHBVNL |

The sub-committees may share data amongst themselves related with this case. Doubts if any/clarification if any necessitated by the members be attended on priority by all the administrative offices. The progress made by the members will be reviewed in the next meeting.
29.09.2014
[F-55]

1. During the proceedings of the meeting
a. The Committee granted personal hearing to the Respondents/Petitioners in the connected cases of CWP no. 16330 of 2005, who requested for granting them personal hearing but could not attend the personal hearing scheduled for them. The personal hearing to other Petitioners i.e. CWP no. 10195/1993, 10168/2006, 798/2007 and CWP no. 12395/1997 which have been decided by the Hon'ble Court by making a reference to orders in CWP no 16330 of 2005 and as per Memo No Ch16/HPG/GE/Genl218/PH/C dated 01.09.2014 has been granted.
b. The committee deliberated the progress of work assigned as per Sr. No. 03 of the MOM dated 05.05.2014 and noted that the work is time consuming which requires analytical legal perusal.
c. The Committee noted the fact that members of the Sub-Committees have not been relieved by the respective Administrative Heads as per directions contained in MOM dated 10.09.2014 and deliberated that they may be got relieved for facilitation of the Committee.
d. The Committee deliberated the progress of compilation of data in respect of the representations/submission given by petitioners/ respondents.
2. After deliberations, the Committee decided as under:-
3. The submissions made by the petitioner (Parveen Arora \& Ors. ) in CWP no. 16330




Poonam Bhasin $\begin{array}{cccc}\text { Member-cum- } & \text { Member-cum- } & \text { Member- } & \text { Chairperson- } \\ \text { SE/Admn.-I, } & \text { CE/Admn, } & \text { CE/Admn., } & \text { cum-LR/HPUs. } \\ \text { HVPNL } & \text { DHBVNL } & \text { HPGCL } & \end{array}$



|  |  | ii. The Seniority lists of Engineering Subordinates of Generation Cadre (JE/JE-I/BC/FM-I etc) for the period 01.01.1988 onwards along with relevant files wherein issued are required for consulting \& deriving the important data immediately by the members deputed in HPGCL in CWP No. 16330 of 2005. The data would be available with Chief Engineer/PTPS-2, HPGCL, Panipat. <br> d. The Committee noted the fact that the seniority lists of JE's \& JE-I (Field Cadre) is required to be joined with seniority list of JE's \& JE-I (Generation Cadre) for making compliance of the orders of Hon'ble High Court. Sh. Sunil, Superintendent along with Sh. Vikas, UDC from DHBVNL also attended proceedings of the meeting and the seniority lists in respect of Field Cadre as brought by them was already in record which does not serve the complete purpose. It was deliberated that during the year 1988 to 1998 the Cadre Controlling Authority of Field Cadre for the post of JEs and JE-I was CE/Operation, HSEB, Hisar now CE/HR\&Admn., DHBVNL Hisar, as such, his office is custodian of record. <br> 2. After deliberations, the Committee decided as under:- <br> a. The Committee noted the fact of not relieving of few members of the Sub-Committees by their respective Administrative Heads as per directions contained in MOM dated 10.09.2014 \& 29.09.2014 and despite written recommendations. The Members of this Committee are requested to take up the matter with their Administrative Heads and ensure that all the members of Sub-Committee participate collectively for reaching on common consensus to avoid contempt of Court. <br> b. The Member Secretary may take up the matter in writing with CE/HR\&Admn., DHBVNL, Hisar to ensure supply of all the relevant record relating to seniority lists of JEs \& JE-I (Field Cadre) latest by 16.10.2014 through special messenger well conversant with record as sought by the members of the Sub-Committee. <br> c. The Members of the Sub-Committees who are working in the Conference Hall of HPGCL will proceed on leave with prior approval of Member Secretary, Main Committee. <br> d. The Administrative Officers of the respective Utilities be requested not to sanction/allow leave of any kind to the Members of the SubCommittees till the finalization of this case. <br> e. The Committee decided that the next meeting of the Committee will be held on 20.10.2014 to analyse the progress made by the SubCommittees and to make a view on the Representations/Submissions given by the Petitioners/Respondents during the personal hearings as the personal hearing to the concerned has been concluded |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 19 | $\begin{aligned} & 20.10 .2014 \\ & {[F-57]} \end{aligned}$ | 2. During the proceedings of the meeting:- <br> a) The committee observed absence of Sh. V.K. Jain, GM/Commercial, UHBVNL, Panchkula who could not attend meeting due his leave. <br> b) The committee deliberated the progress of work assigned as per MoM dated 04.04.2014 circulated vide Memo No Ch-25/HPG/GE-218/L dated 16.04.2014 \&Sr. No. 03 of the MoM dated 10.09.2014 circulated vide Memo No. Ch-15/HPG/GE-$218-\mathrm{B} / \mathrm{PH} / \mathrm{Vol}-\mathrm{II}$ dated 22.09.2014 and noted that the work is time consuming which requires analytical legal perusal and is likely to complete in next few days. <br> c) The Committee deliberated the fact with concern that few members of the Sub-Committees have not been relieved by their respective Administrative Heads as per directions contained in MoM dated 10.09.2014 \& 29.09.2014 and noted the fact that members have still not been relieved by their Administrative heads despite written recommendations. |




The following members of the sub-committees attended the meeting:- (please refer to flag-57). The Committee noted the fact that Sh. Pankaj Bakshi, Assistant-cum-Member Secretary, Sub Committee of UHBVNL did not attend the meeting due to his attending the Hon'ble Court at Rohtak.
e)
n compliance to the minutes of the meeting held on 04.04.2014 and 10.09.2014 circulated vide Memo No. Ch-15/HPG/GE-218-B/PH/Vol-II dated 22.09.2014, the members of the joint subcommittee placed on record the spade work in respect of AMIE/BE i.e 12.5\% Quota for the assistance of Main Committee within the specified time. The Committee noted the fact that the spade work submitted by the Joint Sub-Committee is based on the record made available to the committee by all the Utilities and spade work is only for the purpose of assistance and names mentioned in the lists are only indicative and it should in no manner be construed as the seniority of the person or rights of any person to claim a post on the dates indicated in the list. The following spade work was considered and deliberated at length:-
a) Year wise Joint Ranking List of Engineering Subordinates having $\mathrm{AMIE} / \mathrm{BE}$ degree for the period 19.02.1988 till 14.08.1998 under 12.5 \% Quota after clubbing from amongst Field Cadre \& Generation Cadre Annexure-11 i.e L-3 in compliance to CWP no. 6557/1993 \& its order dated 29.07.1997, LPA No. 657/1997 dismissed vide order dated 17.12.2004.
b) Year wise Joint Ranking List of Engineering Subordinates having AMIE/BE degree for the period 19.02.1988 till 14.08.1998 under 12.5 \% Quota after taking into consideration L-3 i.e Annexure-11, by placing engineering subordinates in respective year as per available quota post brought out in Para-2 based on Regulations in vogue as Annexure-12 i.e L-4, in compliance to CWP no. 6557/1993 \& its order dated 29.07.1997, LPA No. 657/1997 dismissed vide order dated 17.12.2004.
c) Joint Ranking List of Engineering Subordinates having AMIE/BE degree under 12.5 \% Quota who cannot be considered for quota post due to non availability of quota post as on 14:08.1998 Annexure-13 i.e L-5.
d) Year wise Joint Ranking List of Engineering Subordinates having AMIE/BE degree under 12.5 \% Quota from amongst Petitioner \& Respondents Annexure-14 i.e L-6.
e) The re-assigning of date of seniority to Assistant Engineers on the basis of availability of Quota posts under $12.5 \%$ from the date they could reckon their service as per submission made in Para-2 can only be done after the completion of spade work related to $22.5 \%$ quota as per regulation No. 21/REG-18 dated 19.02.1988 \& subject to the statutory condition they are fit for promotion on that particular date of year.
f) The Committee referred to the MoM dated 14.10 .2014 wherein it was deliberated that the seniority lists of JE's \& JE-I (Field Cadre) is required to be joined with seniority list of JE's \& JE-I (Generation Cadre) for making compliance of the orders of Hon'ble High Court. It was also deliberated that during the year 1988 to 1998 the Cadre Controlling Authority of Field Cadre for the post of JEs and JE-I was CE/Operation, HSEB, Hisar now CE/HR \& Admn., DHBVNL Hisar, as such, his office is custodian of record.

3
After deliberations, the Committee decided as under:-


|  |  | 1 | A |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  | in |  |
|  |  | M |  |
|  |  |  |  | in respect Sub-Committee has been acknowledged and accepted by all the Members of the Committee of all Utilities.

2 The Committee noted the fact of not relieving of few members of the Sub-Committee as per MoM dated 18.09.2014 circulated vide Memo No Ch-41/HPG/GE-218-B/PH/Vol-II dated 30.09.2014 by Administrative Head of DHBVNL and absence of members of the sub-committee notified vide O/0 No 133/GM/Admn dated 20.03.2014 during the Meeting on 20.10.2014 with grave concern. The CE/HR \& Admn., DHBVNL, Hisar vide Memo No-Ch-43/HPG/GE-218-B/PH/Vol-II dated 09.10.2014 and as per directions at $\mathrm{Sr} \mathrm{No}-3$ (2) of MoM dated 14.10.2014 circulated vide Memo No Ch-52/HPG/GE-218-B/PH/Nol-II dated 14.10.2014 followed by E-Mail dated 14.10.2014 \& SMS dated 16.10.2014 was requested to ensure supply of all relevant record relating to seniority lists of JEs \& JE-I (Field Cadre) latest by 16.10.2014 through well conversant officers/officials.
Non-compliance of Orders is viewed seriously. As such, the CE/HR \& Admn, DHBVNL to ensure initiation of disciplinary proceedings against delinquent officers/officials \& compliance be placed on record in next meeting.
3 The Member Secretary may take up the matter telephonically with CE/HR \& Admn., DHBVNL, Hisar for reliving of members of subcommittee of DHBVNL and their making available of all relevant record as sought by the joint sub-committee.
4 The Committee appreciated the arduous job performed by the members of the Joint Sub-Committee for submission of spade work within specified time.
5 The Committee decided that the next meeting of the Committee will be held on 27.10.2014 to analyse the progress made by the Joint Sub-Committee and to make a view on the Representations/Submissions given by the Petitioners/Respondents during the personal hearings as the personal hearing to the concerned has been concluded.

## During the proceedings of the meeting:-

a) The committee noted that Sh. V.K. Jain, GM/Commercial, UHBVNL, Panchkula did not attend meeting due to his leave.
b) The Committee deliberated that Sh. Barjesh Gaind, Superintendent-cum-Chairman, Sub-Committee, HVPNL on dated 21.10.2014 made submission that the spade work regarding framing of common Seniority lists of Engineering Subordinates under 22.5\% Diploma Holder Quota from amongst Generation Cadre \& Field Cadre in compliance to Orders of the Hon'ble Court in CWP No. 10195 of 1993, 12395 of 1997, 11909 of 2006, 12099 of 2006, 17721 of 2006, 10168 of 2006 \& 798 of 2007is yet to be started by the members enlisted from amongst sub-committees of utilities as per minutes of the meeting held on 18.09.2014. The perusal of MoM dated 04.04.2014 would reveal that all the Utilities had placed on record all the seniorities/regulations available in their records for the assistance of Main Committee which was attended by all members of the sub-committee of DHBVNL except Shri Arun Kumar, Sr AO. The Sub-Committee of DHBVNL had been participating in the proceedings of the meetings from time to time but none of the member has shown their responsibility for placing on record the seniorities relating with JEs of Field Cadre even when they knew that in the year 1988 to 1998, the Cadre Controlling Authority of Field Cadre for the post of JEs and JE-I was CE/Operation, HSEB, Hisar now CE/HR \& Admn., DHBVNL Hisar. Despite best efforts and eloquence, the members of joint



V.K.Jain Sukarm singh
Member-cum- Member-cum-
GM/UHBVNL $\begin{gathered}\text { SE/Admn.-I, } \\ \text { HVPNL }\end{gathered}$

R.R. Goel R.K.Bansal
Member-cum- MemberHPGCL

Poonam Bhasin
ChairpersonHVPNL $\quad$ DHBVNL,
memo no. $36 / \mathrm{NGE} / \mathrm{O}-105 \mathrm{dt}$. 11.11.1987 the options of these JEs working in Thermal/Hydel Projects on their receipt from respective CEs were entrusted to the screening Committee (s) for determining the suitability of such JEs being absorbed in the Generation cadre or otherwise. The report of the screening committee (s) was received with their due recommendations. These recommendations were considered carefully and it has been decided as under:-
(i) JEs/Thermal, as mentioned in the list marked as per Annexuer-'A' who have opted for the Generation Cadre and are also recommended by the Screening Committee for their absorption as such, may be allowed to be absorbed in the Generation Cadre.
(ii)Those JEs/field, as mentioned in the list marked as Annexuer-'B', presently working in Thermal Station or Hydel Station, Who have opted for the Generation Cadre and are recommended by the Screening Committee for absorption as such, may be allowed to be absorbed in the Generation Cadre subject to the terms of the letter calling options.
(iii) Those JEs/field, as per detail given in the list marked as Annexuer-'C', who have opted for field cadre but presently working in the Thermal/Hydel projects of HSEB may be allowed to be transferred out of Generation organization.
(iv) Those JEs/field, as mentioned in the list attached and marked as Annexuer-'D', who have opted for the Generation Cadre but have not been recommended by the screening Committee for absorption as such are to be transferred out of Generation organization, but before making their transfer orders, such JEs are to be intimated about the recommendations of Screening Committee, such JEs can also prefer appeal to the Member Technical ( $\mathrm{O} \& \mathrm{P}$ ) in terms of clause(g) of the letter calling options and the result of the appeal no preferred by such JEs, may be awaited.
(v)The matter in respect of JEs/Thermal, as mentioned in the list attached and marked as Annexuer-' $E$ ', who have opted for Field organization is being looked into and decision regarding them shall be communicated separately.
(vi) The decision in respect of those JEs/Thermal, as mentioned in the list attached and marked as Annexuer-' $F$ ', who have opted for Generation cadre but their names have not been recommended by Screening Committee for absorption is also being conveyed separately.
(vii) Those JEs/field, whose names are mentioned in the list attached and marked as Annexuer-' $G$ ', have given their conditional options contrary to the guidelines contained in letter calling options referred above may be allowed to continue in their original cadre.
2. It is again pointed out that the action on the point against (iv) above is to be taken in accordance with para- $4(\mathrm{~g})$ of the specimen option letter dated 11.11.87 issued by this office referred to above and determining of inter-se seniority of JEs/field as per point (ii) above is to be taken in accordance with para-4 (h) of the said


